

**MINUTES
PUBLIC SESSION
BOARD OF DIRECTORS
CORPORATION FOR PUBLIC BROADCASTING
WASHINGTON, D.C.
Wednesday, June 21 – Thursday, June 22, 2023**

Call to Order

Chair Ross called to order the public session of the Board of Directors at 9:39 am Eastern Time on Wednesday, June 21, 2023. The following directors were in attendance:

Laura G. Ross, Chair;
Ruby Calvert, Vice Chair;
Miriam Hellreich;
Diane Kaplan;
Bruce M. Ramer;
Tom Rothman (arrived at 12:10 pm); and
Liz Sembler (attended Day Two virtually).

Kathy Im was absent.

The following officers and staff were also in attendance:

Patricia Harrison, President and Chief Executive Officer;
Michael Levy, Executive Vice President and Chief Operating Officer;
Teresa Safon, Senior Vice President, Chief of Staff and Corporate Secretary;
Bill Tayman, Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer;
Anne Brachman, Senior Vice President, External Affairs;
Stacey Decker, Senior Vice President, Innovation and System Strategies;
Kathy Merritt, Senior Vice President, Radio, Journalism and CSG Services;
Deb Sanchez, Senior Vice President, Educational Media and Learning Experiences;
Kathryn Washington, Senior Vice President, Television Content;
Stephen Wilkins, Senior Vice President, DEI;
Stephen Wolfe, Chief Technology Officer, Senior Vice President, Information Technology;
Kimberly Howell, Inspector General;
Kate Arno, Vice President, Community Service Grants and Station Initiatives;
Deborah Carr, Vice President, Operations and Strategy;
Brendan Daly, Vice President, External Affairs and Communications;
Michael Fragale, Vice President and General Manager, Education Strategy and Content;
Beth Jacobs, Vice President, Digital Strategy and Innovation;
Joy Lin, Vice President, Journalism;
Cheraine Stanford, Vice President, Television Content;
Beth Walsh, Vice President, System Strategies;
Jacquie Gales Webb, Vice President, Radio; and
Sarah Kildall, Board Affairs Manager.

The following guests were also in attendance:

John Bailey, senior fellow at the American Enterprise Institute;
 John Bredar, Vice President for National Programming, GBH;
 Danielle Broza, Digital Lead, Content and Strategy, PBS Nature;
 Oren Etzioni, Chief Executive Officer, Allen Institute for Artificial Intelligence;
 Terry Fitzpatrick, Vice President for Children’s Media and Education, from GBH;
 Elizabeth Hansen Shapiro, CEO and Co-Founder, National Trust for Local News;
 Fred Kaufman, Executive Producer, PBS Nature;
 Thomas Patterson, Professor at the Shorenstein Center on Media, Politics, and Public Policy at the Harvard Kennedy School;
 Nadia Rawls, Senior Director, Brand Marketing and Audience Development, NOVA;
 Jim Schachter, President and CEO, New Hampshire Public Radio;
 Richard Tofel, former President, ProPublica; and
 Lillian McDonald, Managing Director of TPT Now, Twin Cities PBS (Day 2).

Adoption of Agenda and Determination of Closed Status

Chair Ross called for a motion to adopt the agenda and close the meeting for agenda items 10 through 14. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the agenda was adopted as presented. (*6 in favor, 2 absent*)

Invitation to Disclose Conflicts of Interest

In accordance with the CPB Code of Ethics for Directors, Chair Ross invited directors to disclose possible conflicts of interest regarding the meeting agenda. Ms. Kaplan noted that she disclosed to Mr. Smithers that her stepson is chief operating officer at Koahnic Public Broadcasting, which is a CPB grantee, and Mr. Smithers found no conflict. There were no further disclosures.

Approval of Minutes

Chair Ross called for a motion to approve the minutes of the public session of the April 17-18, 2023 meeting. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the minutes were approved as presented. (*6 in favor, 2 absent*)

Chair and Directors’ Remarks

Chair Ross welcomed guest speakers and noted that the agenda includes many complex and in-depth updates about the work of CPB and public media including reports on artificial intelligence, public media journalism, public safety innovations and CPB’s Goals and Objectives. No other directors offered remarks.

Resolution of Condolence for Newton Minow

Mr. Ramer presented the resolution of condolence for the family and colleagues of Newton Minow, former FCC chairman and public broadcasting’s founding father. Chair Ross asked for a motion to adopt the resolution of condolence. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the resolution was approved. (*6 in favor, 2 absent*)

Resolution of Condolence for Ron Hull

Ms. Calvert presented the resolution of condolence for the family and colleagues of Ron Hull, public broadcaster, a founder of Nebraska Educational Television, and director of CPB's program fund in its early years. Chair Ross asked for a motion to adopt the resolution. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the resolution was approved. (6 in favor, 2 absent)

Resolution regarding 2023 Board Meeting Location

Chair Ross noted the resolution in the materials regarding relocating the Board's December 11-12, 2023 meeting to Southern California. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the resolution was approved. (6 in favor, 2 absent)

Chair Ross also noted that CPB management can assist board members with arranging individual or small group visits to public media stations apart from the board meeting schedule.

President's Report

Ms. Harrison reported that the Fiscal Responsibility Act of 2023, signed by President Biden on June 3, raised the debt ceiling limit through January 2025. The legislation holds FY 2024 funding at the same level as FY 2023 funding and allows a 1% increase in FY 2025. If Congress is unable to pass all 12 appropriations bills by the end of calendar year 2023, then a 1% cut will be enacted across all 12 bills. Last week, the House announced its plan to mark up spending bills at the FY 2022 funding level, which resulted in the Labor-H Subcommittee receiving a funding allocation 29% lower than FY 2023 funding (more than \$60 billion). CPB anticipates a significant reduction in CPB's funding in the House bill, while the Senate announced its intention to comply with the funding levels outlined in the debt ceiling agreement. If the House and Senate cannot resolve their funding differences and are operating on a Continuing Resolution (CR) on January 1, then the 1% cut will apply.

Ms. Harrison reported that the House Homeland Security Appropriation Subcommittee appropriated \$40 million for the Next Generation Warning System (NGWS) grant program. CPB will continue to engage with appropriators in the House and Senate to discuss the importance of federal funding for content and services, especially in rural communities.

Ms. Harrison reported that this quarter, in consultation with the public media system, CPB developed a recommendation for a request to the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) for an advance appropriation for FY 2027, including a request for public broadcasting interconnection system and other infrastructure for FY 2025.

Ms. Harrison reported on CPB's continued engagement with the public media system through events such as the PBS Annual Meeting and the Public Media Business Conference. CPB senior staff participated in forums and panels on journalism, education, technology and diversity. CPB's presentation at the PBS Annual Meeting was attended by nearly 1,400 public media professionals. It showcased CPB's support of diverse talent, content and innovation, featuring actor, writer, executive producer John Leguizamo, creator and host of the CPB-funded three-part series, *American Historia: The untold History of Latinos*.

Ms. Harrison also reported on Community Service Grant (CSG) Consultation Panels and preparation for the next CPB-hosted General Managers Meeting in July.

Ms. Harrison concluded her report. Mr. Ramer asked about the status of the NGWS grant program and the Single Sign-On identity management system. Regarding the NGWS program,

Mr. Decker reported that CPB has hired a very solid team to manage the program and that CPB continues to work with stations and FEMA regarding stations' technology needs. Ms. Jacobs reported that the Single Sign-On customer identity management platform will be deployed by PBS and NPR across the public media system later this fall. There were no further questions.

Connecting to New Audiences: *NOVA* and *Nature*

Ms. Washington reported that CPB has provided support to major PBS series to adopt strategies for content development, multiplatform distribution, and connecting to new audiences, and introduced John Breder, Vice President for National Programming at GBH and Nadia Rawls, Senior Director, Brand Marketing and Audience Development at *NOVA*.

Mr. Breder reported on *NOVA*'s strategy for expanding relevance in a disrupted media environment. With CPB support, *NOVA* has been able to experiment with content on streaming platforms, and changed the way they reach and teach audiences.

Mr. Breder reported that *NOVA* recognized that to set itself apart from other science programs available on the many different streaming services, *NOVA* programs must tell a compelling story, ask important questions, involve scientists that reflect the American people, and throughout provide entertainment. *NOVA* does not seek to tell audiences what to think but instead shows them the process for reaching a conclusion. The world is complicated and as content creators, *NOVA* wants its content to help make better informed citizens. *NOVA* reaches 30 million people per month in a variety of ways because its content is relevant, diverse and broadly appealing.

Ms. Rawls reported that since CPB first began supporting *NOVA*'s digital expansion, *NOVA* has seen exponential audience growth. Last year, *NOVA* had 32 million unique viewers on broadcast, 21 million on YouTube, 3.3 million on streaming and on social media saw 69 million video views. The majority of viewers across digital platforms were 25 to 44, with website views skewing under the age of 24, thanks largely to *NOVA*'s presence in classrooms. These younger audiences are accessing *NOVA*'s longform documentaries through various streaming platforms. She noted an important distinguishing factor amongst *NOVA*'s viewers is its political balance. The political affiliations (Republican, Democratic, and Independent) of viewers are divided almost evenly and across all generations of viewers. The appeal of *NOVA*'s content to viewers across the political spectrum in these politically polarized times speaks to the trusted nature of *NOVA*'s content and the curiosity that unites its viewers.

Ms. Rawls reported that YouTube has been an important platform for *NOVA*'s digital growth. The average watch time has increased to over 21 minutes, which in turn prompts YouTube to recommend *NOVA* content to other viewers, thus continuing audience growth. *NOVA*'s most-watched documentary topics are space, archaeology, and sinkholes, and the CPB-funded program, "The Cannabis Question" has been one of *NOVA*'s most popular shows on YouTube.

Ms. Rawls reported on *NOVA*'s growth on social media, noting CPB's support has given *NOVA* the flexibility to adapt quickly as platforms change. *NOVA* creates short videos for platforms like Instagram to reach new audiences. Social media followers, who are often younger, then find extended content on other social media platforms. In classrooms, *NOVA* has launched *NOVA Science Studio*, an ongoing project funded in part by CPB, that teaches students how to find a story, report, film, edit, and publish it with support from *NOVA* and their local public

media station. The project promotes youth voices and empowers them to become participants, not just passive viewers. As part of the CPB-Funded Science and Society Grant, *NOVA* is working with the *NOVA Science Studio* and currently working with 10 public media stations across the country to create digital content and support audience development. A major part of *NOVA*'s work with stations is to promote a strategic approach that understands and serves specific communities and audiences and their media preferences and habits. CPB's support has accelerated and expanded *NOVA*'s digital presence, and created new pathways for communication and knowledge-sharing throughout the public media system.

Ms. Calvert asked if the original *NOVA* episodes are re-edited so that they meet the 21-minute benchmark. Ms. Rawls reported that *NOVA* episodes on YouTube are the same full-length programs that were originally broadcast over the air. For new content being premiered online simultaneous with the broadcast, *NOVA* offers online engagement such as a scientist from the show engaging live with viewers in the comments. Ms. Sembler asked if the primary goal is still to create long-form documentaries. Ms. Rawls reported affirmatively, people are still interested in watching full-length shows online and *NOVA*'s goal is to make the full-length program readily available to them. While *NOVA*'s short-form clips can tell a briefer story, they are also meant to entice younger audiences to the full-length program to learn more and cultivate a relationship with *NOVA*.

Ms. Washington introduced *Nature* Executive Producer Fred Kaufman and Digital Lead Danielle Broza. Mr. Kaufman reported that *Nature* has been a staple of public television for 40-plus years and a voice for the natural world. Last season it averaged 1.8 million viewers. With the natural world and the health of the planet being high-interest topics, *Nature* programming is no longer niche. *Nature*'s content has moved from observational wildlife documentaries to becoming frontline communicators about environmental issues like climate change and habitat destruction. Mr. Kaufman highlighted three upcoming shows including an innovative series around building robotic animals.

Mr. Kaufman introduced Ms. Broza, noting the hiring of a digital lead is a result of CPB's Digital Transformation program. Ms. Broza reported on *Nature*'s use of the CPB digital transformation grant to create content that extends the reach of the broadcast program, helping *Nature* reach a younger audience and lengthening the time they are available on PBS Passport and the *Nature* website.

Ms. Broza discussed the *Nature* FAST Channel (Free Ad-Supported Streaming Television), which launched in October 2022 and has streamed over 2.2 million hours. *Nature* uses social media platforms to preview shorter clips, and streaming platforms to showcase their full-length original digital series. *Nature* has partnered with PBS Digital Studios four times in the last two years to create some of these original series. *Nature*'s online community appeals to broadcast fans and those who are new to the show; *Nature*'s interactive pages allow audiences to explore specific topics further.

Ms. Broza reported on *Nature*'s work with the WNET education team and teachers to create a children's series that will be distributed by PBS LearningMedia. Podcasts are another medium that can be used by teachers and general audiences, and listenership has doubled in Season Two; Season Three is in production and will continue to feature diverse topics and talent. She reviewed audience demographics of broadcast versus website noting that over 65% of the broadcast audience is over 65 years old; almost 90% of website views are users under 65 years

old; and 72% of YouTube viewers are under 50 years old. YouTube is the most important metric when looking at audience growth.

Discussion ensued about use in classrooms. Ms. Sembler inquired about commercials running during the online streaming of the program. Mr. Kaufman reported that advertising is displayed at the top but does not interrupt the program. Ms. Broza noted that *Nature* does not run advertising on its YouTube channel. Discussion ensued about advertising guidelines for PBS versus FAST channels.

Chair Ross thanked Messrs. Bredar and Kaufman and Mses. Rawls, Broza and Washington for their presentations.

Overview of Children and Youth Content Projects

Ms. Sanchez reported on CPB's ongoing work to meet the educational and development needs of youth and children. In 2020, CPB engaged with the Joan Ganz Cooney Center to research how public media can best meet the educational, civic and career needs of tweens and teens in a multimedia environment. Research and focus group conversations over three years show that young people value factual information, seeing themselves accurately represented and content that helps them gain new skills. With these findings, the Cooney Center has provided recommendations and opportunities for local public media stations and producers to include young people in content development and media training.

Ms. Sanchez reported on how this research informed WNET's American Graduate: Jobs Explained. The project's short-form videos on social media platforms are of high interest to teens. WNET also created a professional development series to help other public media stations grow their digital production capacities and build new partnerships with local schools and businesses.

Ms. Sanchez reported on public media's longstanding commitment to high-quality educational content for young children and how public media is adapting to change in the media environment. She reported on multi-platform resources like the PBS KIDS website, mobile video app, mobile game app and other streaming services such as YouTube, where children and parents can access children's public media content.

Ms. Sanchez reported on the Department of Education's Ready To Learn (RTL) grant, noting that since 1995 it has provided nearly \$650 million to support educational content and public media station innovations in family, educator and children engagement.

Ms. Sanchez introduced Terry Fitzpatrick, Vice President for Children's Media and Education at GBH in Boston. Mr. Fitzpatrick oversees children's producers, game designers and education professionals, including public media's latest project, *Work It Out Wombats!*.

Mr. Fitzpatrick gave an overview of GBH's Children's Media and Education department and its slate of work, including work with PBS KIDS to address the changes happening with children's media engagement. GBH's four priority curriculum areas for content production are STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering & Math); Literacy; Emotional Well-Being and Civic Engagement (executive function and self-regulation skills); and Arts/Creativity. Mr. Fitzpatrick reported on the GBH children's programs currently in production, how they address these priority areas, and their diversity, equity, inclusion and accessibility components.

Mr. Fitzpatrick reported on how GBH works with PBS KIDS' on digital strategies to engage children on multi-media platforms with both short and long form content, livestreams and games. Podcasts are available on PBS KIDS-owned video and audio apps, the YouTube channel and other audio platforms through a deal with PRX distribution, and offer an opportunity for "co-listening" between children and parents. PBS KIDS' first podcast series, *Molly of Denali*, launched in May of 2019, followed by *Pinkalicious & Peterrific* in October 2020. PBS KIDS' first original podcast production *Keyshawn Solves it!* premiered in May, and GBH is gathering feedback as part of the development process. *Work It Out Wombats!* will premiere its first podcast season in December of 2023. All of these podcasts were produced by GBH.

Mr. Fitzpatrick reported on the research underpinning *Work It Out Wombats!*, a cross-platform PBS KIDS program focusing on computational thinking skills (problem solving and exploration), with diverse characters, settings and stories. GBH has produced 40 half-hour episodes, four games, a series website, an eight-episode podcast series, 31 resources for PBS LearningMedia, and local engagement activities funded by CPB. The episodes feature diverse representation of culturally relevant narratives, environments and characters, in the animation, voice talent and writers – building on the ground-breaking CPB funded *Molly of Denali* Writing Fellowship. Mr. Fitzpatrick thanked CPB for its support of *Work It Out Wombats!* and children's content.

Chair Ross asked if GBH or PBS KIDS has measured the impact of COVID-19 on educational work and taken steps to address any impacts. Mr. Fitzpatrick reported that GBH has been reviewing multiple studies and reports about learning in a COVID-19/post-COVID-19 environment. GBH also conducted studies to gauge and remedy specific educational needs/gaps that have resulted from COVID-19 learning disruptions. Ms. Sanchez noted that public media is addressing the issue of literacy with PBS KIDS' relaunch of the popular literacy program *Super Why!* with a more modern look to appeal to children today.

Ms. Hellreich asked how many stations use these educational resources and how public media is spreading the word about these materials. Mr. Fitzpatrick reported that 125 public media licensees representing over 300 stations use the outreach materials through PBS KIDS. For educators, PBS LearningMedia resources are paired with curriculum modules being taught in classrooms. Ms. Sanchez noted that PBS resources are trusted classroom tools and the relationships between local stations and their schools and childcare programs are a vital part of introducing these resources into the classroom.

Mr. Rothman joined the meeting at 12:10 pm Eastern Time.

Ms. Sembler thanked GBH for their work in educational children's content and innovation and asked about local ties going through PBS Passport or pbs.org to access this content. Mr. Fitzpatrick reported that entering a zip code allows the user to access local station content and tie it to local school curriculum. Mr. Ramer asked about introducing civic engagement at such a young age. Mr. Fitzpatrick reported that civic learning for young children may address skills like executive functioning and self-regulation skills like how to cooperate and collaborate – essential skills for civic discourse. Ms. Kaplan asked if the audience data represents unduplicated viewers. Mr. Fitzpatrick reported that broadcast viewership numbers are unique and aggregate data is of streams and could be the same portion of viewers.

Chair Ross thanked Ms. Sanchez and Mr. Fitzpatrick for their report.

The meeting adjourned for lunch at 12:15 pm Eastern Time.

The meeting resumed in public session at 12:53 pm Eastern Time.

Report on Artificial Intelligence (A.I.)

Chair Ross welcomed Oren Etzioni, founding CEO of the Allen Institute for Artificial Intelligence, and John Bailey, nonresident senior fellow at the American Enterprise Institute, where he focuses on artificial intelligence, education, and other innovation issues.

Mr. Etzioni gave an overview of A.I., defining it as a tool and the next step in the evolution of software. He noted it should really stand for augmented intelligence. As a tool, people can use it in various ways to enhance their capabilities, which presents challenges, risks and benefits. Mr. Etzioni discussed the evolution of A.I. beginning with neural networks in the 1950s inspired by human brain functions, and scaled up in recent years with more powerful computers that can perform functions such as data mining, supervised learning, classification, categorization and deep learning – all facets of A.I. but each using narrow and targeted data. In 2018, machines began to label their own data without relying on external feedback and without needing pre-defined concepts, moving A.I. from narrow to generative.

Mr. Etzioni reported on technological challenges of A.I. including A.I. “hallucinations” – instances where A.I. can fabricate stories, people and facts, and unreliability in its responses depending on how a question is phrased. There is also the concern about A.I. spreading misinformation. Despite these negative impacts, A.I. can create opportunities for people to use it in a creative way and learn new skills. With this technology rapidly changing it is important to continuously research where A.I. is being used and what data it is using.

Mr. Etzioni described potential practical uses for public media such as content translation or creation of interactive experiences. Mr. Etzioni concluded by noting that this is disruptive technology, and the choice is up to the public as to how and how much it is utilized.

Mr. Bailey reported on specific examples of A.I. and provided demonstrations of its capabilities in various spaces. He noted the pace of improvement of this technology is astounding and Chat GPT was able to pass most high school and college level exams within months of its creation. Over time, A.I. “learns” from its mistakes by taking in feedback and refines its answers to questions from immediate “hallucinations” to more accurate information. In the education space, Mr. Bailey discussed A.I.’s abilities to create lesson plans based on state education standards, which can be used in various ways – as a productivity tool for teachers or a personalized tutor that simplifies a subject and/or teaches it as a specific character. He reported on ways public media stations can use A.I. tools, for example using a Chat GPT plugin to analyze and assess the strength of a station’s “call to action” function on their website and provide feedback for maximizing donations. A.I. can also analyze audience data for patterns and trends to help create a marketing pitch, A.I. solutions offering timely calculations and interpretations from large sets of data. Mr. Bailey discussed how A.I. generation of images can assist in making content graphics.

Mr. Rothman expressed concern about the capabilities of A.I. and asked about regulating it. Mr. Bailey reported that the highest levels of people are monitoring and responding to A.I. Educational settings will have to deal with the possibilities and challenges presented by A.I. – shortcuts to learning – but this technology is ultimately promoting engagement with subject

matter. Higher education settings are using “hallucinations” as reasons for peer reviews. Three major questions have emerged about regulating generative A.I.: 1) a debate about a central A.I. regulator versus the dispersion into different sectors; 2) what exactly should be regulated and using a risk-based framework for determining such regulation; and 3) should certifications be required to use A.I. – global debates are happening around this issue and there is draft legislation in the Senate about it.

Mr. Etzioni noted that while some concerns about A.I. are valid and imminent, some are merely hypothetical. Technology moves in unpredictable ways but that does not mean it is destructive. Nuclear codes ending up in the wrong hands is more hypothetical while cybercrime and misinformation are more realistic and imminent concerns. Social media is an example of how misinformation can be spread by technology and CPB and public media can have an impact in this space starting with educating people to know what information to trust. The important thing is identifying actionable and realistic concerns and forming an action plan.

Discussion further ensued about regulating A.I., whether this is the responsibility of the industry or on an outside regulatory agency. Mr. Etzioni noted the way to approach advanced technology is with a balanced point of view – there are positives and negatives – and to not count on the technology industry to regulate themselves. Congress is very aware that these are fast-moving issues. Mr. Bailey noted the benefits to education, healthcare and other businesses and advised caution on the part of policymakers to not suppress innovation by putting policies under the guise of protecting the people. In terms of augmenting human expertise, A.I. can assist medical experts during procedures. Mr. Etzioni recommended that CPB consider what it will do to manage the inevitable and chaotic adoption of A.I. in the coming years.

Mr. Levy invited CPB senior vice presidents to speak about the impact of A.I. in their work. Ms. Merrit reported on the impact of A.I. on public media and journalism – it is used to create transcripts of interviews, translate news stories to other languages and alert reporters on certain topics. This technology can call into question public media’s editorial standards and public media should emphasize transparency was about whether content was created by a human or A.I. Some stations are testing A.I. as DJs and NPR has a working group to look at risks, opportunities and guardrails. Public media organizations are also working on policy statements that keep humans in the loop.

Mr. Decker reported on a new career path that has been created with new A.I. tools: prompt engineering teaches how to ask questions to A.I. for useful answers. A.I. is important to public media in the public safety space and for increasing accessibility.

Chair Ross asked about the guardrails for these specific examples. Ms. Merritt and Mr. Decker reported that the responsible use of this technology is key as is understanding the risks of using A.I. services. Ms. Sembler asked where accuracy and accountability come into play. Mr. Wolfe reported that while utilizing A.I. as a partner to serve audiences that have not been served by public media before it is important to be aware of the risks and to take steps to mitigate them. Mr. Decker noted that A.I. can look at public media station membership and identify outliers, information that can be used to focus on audience expansion. A.I. is transformative and will affect every aspect of CPB’s work.

Ms. Hellreich asked about the ethics of A.I. Mr. Wolfe reported that it is about finding those appropriate places where A.I. can be used to adjust quickly and stay within the scope of

public media standards. Ms. Kaplan asked if anything has been learned from the experience of social media. Mr. Etzioni reported that social media began with great hope and then the public realized it was being used for negative content. A.I. does not seek out negative and extreme content unless it is designed that way. Public media can use the same algorithms to show people alternative points of view associated with fact-checking. Social media that is run by big technology has a different incentive structure than public media and is more inclined to take A.I. to places where we as a society would not want to take it. Mr. Bailey added that another reason for regulation of A.I. is taken from the failure of social media executives to moderate content. There is also a real risk of A.I. mirroring the trends of social media around loneliness and isolation. CPB can establish those guardrails now for public media stations.

Chair Ross thanked Messrs. Bailey, Etzioni and CPB senior staff for their presentations.

Chair Ross called for a break at 2:30 pm Eastern Time.

The meeting resumed at 2:42 pm Eastern Time.

Public Media and Local News

Chair Ross welcomed the following leaders and experts in journalism for a panel discussion on public media and local journalism: Richard Tofel, former president of ProPublica; Tom Patterson, professor at the Shorenstein Center on Media, Politics, and Public Policy at the Harvard Kennedy School; Elizabeth Hansen Shapiro, CEO and co-founder of National Trust for Local News; and Jim Schachter, president and CEO of New Hampshire Public Radio (NHPR) as session moderator.

Ms. Merritt reviewed points raised at the April board meeting's journalist panel discussion regarding the crisis in local journalism, including the loss of newspapers over the past decade, the emergence of "news deserts" and the prevalence of misinformation and disinformation. Today's session is a continuation of the conversation surrounding the challenges facing local journalism. These panelists each have their own perspectives and experiences with and about public media journalism.

Mr. Patterson reported on the local news crisis and how this also means a crisis for communities. Studies have shown a decrease in civic engagement, social cohesion and voting rates in local elections in communities that have lost their local news source. He reported on the findings of his own study, "Public Radio's Part in Filling the Information Gap," that surveyed NPR member stations. With 90% of NPR stations responding, the study provides an accurate profile of the local public radio system. The survey identified lack of funding as the main problem for stations trying to expand their services.

Mr. Patterson reviewed the geographic features of struggling stations – many of which are rural and located in news deserts. Challenges include staffing, even for small newsrooms, and limited funding support and underwriting. Small stations with limited staff are unable to keep up with the digital transformation as their current staff are dedicated to programming that will keep the station on the air.

Mr. Patterson reported that his study found the need for approximately \$150 million in new annual funding to sustain stations and expand their services.

Dr. Hansen Shapiro, CEO and co-founder of the National Trust for Local News, and a Senior Research Fellow at the Tow Center for Digital Journalism at Columbia University's Graduate School of Journalism, discussed how her work focuses on the future of journalism in public media and public policies to support local news. The work of the National Trust is focused on conserving newspapers and collaborating with publishers, community funders and stakeholders to keep local news alive and in local hands. The National Trust also focuses on transforming and sustaining community news organizations to keep up with their rapidly changing communities.

Dr. Hansen Shapiro, co-author of *The Growing Strength of Public Media Local Journalism*, published in 2022, reported on her work with public media over the last two years, noting three key factors affecting public media's service: financial sustainability, journalism capacity and audience reach. The research findings are crucial for journalism organizations in public media and show how funding affects so many aspects of station work. She noted that digital audiences for radio have been the most stable and successful.

Mr. Tofel offered his perspective on news deserts and local journalism, noting that local public media stations will emerge as the answer to the local journalism crisis in communities, however, it will take work, funds and time. Local public television stations have not been large-scale news operations, but with the digital transformation, public television stations are in a strong position to lead with their local news coverage.

Mr. Schacter, President and CEO of New Hampshire Public Radio, reported that his station is representative of a number of the issues discussed by the panelists.

Dr. Hansen Shapiro offered that the fundamental strengths of public media could contribute to a solution to the local news crisis and the bright spots at some stations are pointing in a direction where the whole system can evolve. In terms of time and scale, institutions change more slowly. Mergers and acquisitions are an important way of accelerating some of that evolution. Instead of building a newsroom, a station can acquire a news operation, with new brands, staff, capabilities and in some cases, new audiences.

Ms. Sembler commented that public media has a different set of editorial and integrity standards from potential nonprofit funders and voiced concern about editorial intervention. Discussion ensued about journalistic standards in public and private media, self-policing, and the role of public editors to disclose if a funder is affecting news coverage. Ms. Harrison noted that public media has the public's trust, is very transparent about their funding, and small donations matter as they are a reflection of the connection to community. People need the news, and public media is the best example of a public private partnership.

Mr. Schacter asked each panelist to offer a suggestion to CPB about incentivizing public media journalism. Mr. Tofel proposed redirecting more CPB funding towards digital operations. Dr. Hansen Shapiro proposed encouraging stations to consolidate to reduce redundancy and free up resources to invest in hyperlocal content. Mr. Patterson recommended emphasizing community when making the case to Congress on the importance of funding public media. Mr. Schacter reaffirmed the importance of digital transformation and noted that his station, NHPR, participated in CPB's Digital Culture Accelerator which has helped public media stations reach people and grow audiences.

Chair Ross thanked Mr. Schacter and the panelists for their presentations and discussion.

Adjournment

The meeting adjourned for the day at 4:18 pm Eastern Time.

Public Session

Public session resumed at 9:33 am Eastern Time on Thursday, June 22, 2023.

Discussion of Goals and Objectives

Chair Ross stated that CPB's Goals and Objectives are the foundation for CPB's business planning process which is underway for the coming fiscal year. Each year, the Board reviews the Goals and Objectives, revising them as needed or reaffirming them as they stand, and invited board members to offer comments or recommend revisions to the proposed FY 2024 Goals and Objectives.

Discussion ensued about highlighting interconnection; the convergence of television and radio; and clarifying news coverage versus creating local content. Following the discussion, the Board directed Mr. Levy to incorporate the discussed suggestions into a revised draft of the Goals and Objectives, and present it for approval via unanimous written consent.

Future Agenda Items

Chair Ross invited board members to share any suggestions for future agenda items, noting that she, Ms. Calvert, or Ms. Safon could also be contacted with suggestions after the board meeting.

Executive Session

At 9:50 am, Chair Ross closed the meeting for an executive session. The meeting adjourned in executive session.

[The minutes for these discussions are contained in the executive session record of June 22, 2023.]